

Proceedings of the Meeting of the Leeds City Council held Civic Hall, Leeds on Wednesday, 22nd March, 2023

PRESENT: The Lord Mayor Councillor Robert Gettings MBE JP in the Chair.

WARD

WARD

ADEL & WHARFEDALE

Barry John Anderson Caroline Anderson Billy Flynn ALWOODLEY

Dan Cohen Peter Mervyn Harrand Neil Buckley

ARDSLEY & ROBIN HOOD

Karen Renshaw Mike Foster Lisa Mulherin **ARMLEY**

Alice Smart James McKenna Lou Cunningham BEESTON & HOLBECK

Annie Maloney Gohar Almas Andrew Scopes BRAMLEY & STANNINGLEY

Kevin Ritchie Caroline Gruen Julie Heselwood **BURMANTOFTS & RICHMOND HILL**

Luke Farley Asghar Khan CALVERLEY & FARSLEY

Peter Carlill Andrew Carter CHAPEL ALLERTON

Eileen Taylor Mohammed Rafique Jane Dowson

CROSS GATES & WHINMOOR

Pauleen Grahame James Gibson Jessica Lennox FARNLEY & WORTLEY

Mark Sewards David Blackburn Ann Forsaith GARFORTH & SWILLINGTON

Mark Dobson Sarah Field Suzanne McCormack GIPTON & HAREHILLS

Salma Arif Arif Hussain

GUISELEY & RAWDON

Eleanor Thomson Paul Alderson Paul John Spencer Wadsworth

HAREWOOD

Matthew James Robinson Sam Firth Ryan Stephenson **HEADINGLEY & HYDE PARK**

Jonathon Pryor Alison Garthwaite

HORSFORTH

Emmie Bromley John Garvani

HUNSLET & RIVERSIDE

Ed Carlisle Mohammed Iqbal Paul Wray KILLINGBECK & SEACROFT

John Tudor David Jenkins Katie Dye **KIPPAX & METHLEY**

Mary Elizabeth Harland James Lewis Mirelle Midgley KIRKSTALL

Hannah Bithell Fiona Elizabeth Venner John Anthony Illingworth LITTLE LONDON & WOODHOUSE

Kayleigh Brooks Javaid Akhtar Abigail Marshall-Katung **MIDDLETON PARK** Wayne Dixon Sharon Burke Paul Anthony Truswell **MOORTOWN** Mahalia France-Mir Sharon Hamilton Mohammed Shahzad

MORLEY NORTH

Robert Gettings MBE JP Robert Finnigan Andy Hutchison **MORLEY SOUTH**

Oliver Newton Jane Senior

OTLEY & YEADON

Colin Campbell Sandy Edward Charles Lay Ryk Downes **PUDSEY**

Simon Seary Dawn Seary Trish Smith **ROTHWELL**

Barry Stewart Golton Conrad Hart-Brooke Diane Chapman **ROUNDHAY**

Jordan Bowden Zara Hussain Lisa Martin **TEMPLE NEWSAM**

Debra Coupar Helen Hayden Nicole Sharp **WEETWOOD**

Izaak Wilson Emma Flint Chris Howley **WETHERBY** Norma Harrington Alan James Lamb Linda Richards

89 Announcements

(a) The Lord Mayor welcomed members to this meeting of Full Council and also journalism students from Leeds Beckett University and reminded those present that the meeting was to be streamed live.

(b) The Lord Mayor informed Council that he would adjourn the meeting for a comfort break at an appropriate time in the afternoon.

(c) The Lord Mayor informed Council that it was Councillor Salma Arif's birthday and he also congratulated her on her engagement.

(d) The Lord Mayor informed Council that this would be the last meeting of Council for a number of Councillors as they would not be standing at the local elections in May, The Lord Mayor thanked the following Councillors concerned for many years of public service;

Councillor Forsaith

Councillor Harrand

Councillor Illingworth

Councillor Magsood

Councillor Midgley

Councillor Mulherin

Councillor Ragan

Councillor Truswell

90 Minutes of the last Meeting

It was moved by Councillor Lennox, seconded by Councillor Cohen and

RESOLVED – That the minutes of the meeting held on 22nd February 2023 be approved.

91 Declaration of Interest

Councillor Smart declared a disclosable pecuniary interest as she was employed by Zarach, one of the deputations council was to receive today. Councillor Smart did not vote on the motion to receive the three deputations and vacated the chamber for the Zarach deputation and the subsequent vote to refer the matter to the relevant Director. Minute 93 refers.

92 Communications

The Chief Executive informed Council that;

1) Tracy Brabin, Mayor of West Yorkshire will be attending the Council meeting in July to introduce herself and take questions from Members.

2) a response to a Council resolution in January on Public Services had been received from the Treasury and had been circulated to all Members of Council.

93 Deputations

Three deputations were admitted to the meeting and addressed Council, as follows:-

- 1) A Group regarding green policies and planning decisions
- 2) Friends of Woodhouse Moor
- 3) Leeds based children's charity Zarach

RESOLVED – That the subject matter in respect of deputation 1 and deputation 2 be referred to the Director of City Development for consideration in consultation with the relevant Executive Member, that the subject matter in respect of deputation 3 be referred to the Director of Children and Families for consideration in consultation with the relevant Executive Member.

94 Report on Appointments

It was moved by Councillor Lennox, seconded by Councillor Flint and

RESOLVED – That the report of the City Solicitor on appointments be approved, namely:

• That Caroline Baria be appointed to the Health and Wellbeing Board following the appointment of Caroline Baria as the Interim Director of Adults and Health.

95 Report on the Licensing Annual Report 2022

It was moved by Councillor Gibson, seconded by Councillor Coupar and

RESOLVED – That the Licensing Annual report be received.

96 Report on the Annual Report of the Standards and Conduct Committee It was moved by Councillor Mulherin, seconded by Councillor Coupar and

RESOLVED - That the report of the City Solicitor presenting to Full Council the annual report of the Chair of the Standards and Conduct Committee be received and the matters set out in the annual report be noted.

At the conclusion of this item Council had a brief adjournment at 14:55 to 15:05.

97 Executive Questions

Q1 Councillor Smith to the Executive Member (Economy, Culture and Education):-

To ask the Executive Member for Economy, Culture and Education, how much the council has spent in the last five years on legal fees defending a) cases at the special educational needs and disabilities first tier tribunal; b) cases at the high court related to Section 42 of the Children & Families Act 2014 and/or Section 19 of the Education Act 1996; and how much is the total amount of claimant costs awarded by the court, at the council's expense, over the same period?

The Executive Member (Economy, Culture and Education) replied.

Q2 Councillor Howley to the Executive Member (Infrastructure and Climate):-

Would the Executive Member for Infrastructure and Climate please provide the current budgets for each of the Traffic schemes for Lawnswood Roundabout, Meanwood Junction, Shaw Lane/Otley Rd and the A660 Shaw Lane to St Mark's Rd?

The Executive Member (Infrastructure and Climate) replied.

Q3 Councillor Ritchie to the Executive Member (Infrastructure and Climate):-

Please could the Executive Member provide an update on the state of the Bus Recovery Grant for passengers in Leeds?

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 11.3(b) Cllr Carlill replied

Q4 Councillor Carlisle to the Executive Member (Resources):-

Many of us are concerned about the risk of disenfranchisement of voters, with the new requirement for voters to bring photo ID starting this May. Can the Executive Member for Resources tell me what if any steps Council are taking to record the number of people who turn up wanting to vote, can't through lack of suitable ID, and don't return?

The Executive Member (Resources) replied.

Q5 Councillor Jenkins to the Executive Member (Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships):-

Could the Executive Member for Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships comment on the implementation of the Children's Social Care Review and its impact in Leeds?

The Executive Member (Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships) replied.

Q6 Councillor Richards to the Executive Member (Public Health and Active Lifestyles):-

Can the Executive Member for Public Health and Active Lifestyles please tell us how many sites have been identified and how many trees have been successfully planted in the Outer North East Area during this financial year?

The Executive Member (Public Health and Active Lifestyles) replied.

Q7 Councillor Chapman to the Executive Member (Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships):-

Home Lea House has been standing empty for several months whilst Dolphin Manor is effectively closed to new admissions. This adversely impacts on the provision of care for potential new residents care as well as losing revenue. Could the Executive Member explain why Home Lea House was closed so quickly when the refurbishment plan for Dolphin Manor wasn't in place and confirm when Dolphin Manor will finally begin to accept new patients including in the new Dementia facility?

The Executive Member (Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships) replied.

At the conclusion of question time, the following questions remained unanswered and it was noted that, under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 11.6, written answers would be sent to each Member of Council:-

- Q8 Councillor Sharpe to the Executive Member (Infrastructure and Climate).
- Q9 Councillor Carlisle to the Executive Member (Communities).
- Q10 Councillor Bithell to the Executive Member (Public Health and Active Lifestyles)
- Q11 Councillor Robinson to the Executive Member (Infrastructure and Climate).
- Q12 Councillor Downes to the Executive Member (Resources).
- Q13 Councillor Hamilton to the Executive Member (Environment and Housing).
- Q14 Councillor Forsaith to the Executive Member (Environment and Housing).
- Q15 Councillor Dowson to the Executive Member (Communities).
- Q16 Councillor Flynn to the Executive Member (Resources).
- Q17 Councillor Downes to the Executive Member (Public Health and Active Lifestyles)
- Q18 Councillor Stephenson to the Executive Member (Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships)
- Q19 Councillor Chapman to the Executive Member (Public Health and Active Lifestyles)
- Q20 Councillor Robinson to the Leader of Council.
- Q21 Councillor Downes to the Executive Member (Public Health and Active Lifestyles)
- Q22 Councillor B Anderson to the Executive Member (Environment and Housing).
- Q23 Councillor Downes to the Executive Member (Economy, Culture and Education).
- Q24 Councillor Robinson to the Leader of Council.
- Q25 Councillor Downes to the Executive Member (Economy, Culture and Education).
- Q26 Councillor Stephenson to the Executive Member (Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships)
- Q27 Councillor Downes to the Executive Member (Public Health and Active Lifestyles)
- Q28 Councillor Robinson to the Executive Member (Environment and Housing).

- Q29 Councillor Buckley to the Executive Member (Infrastructure and Climate).
- Q30 Councillor Robinson to the Executive Member (Communities).
- Q31 Councillor Stephenson to the Executive Member (Infrastructure and Climate).
- Q32 Councillor Robinson to the Executive Member (Communities).
- Q33 Councillor Robinson to the Executive Member (Communities).

98 Minutes of the Health and Wellbeing Board and the Executive Board

It was moved by Councillor Lewis, seconded by Councillor Lennox that the minutes be received in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2.2(i).

RESOLVED – That the minutes be received in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2.2(i).

Council Procedure Rule 4, providing for the winding up of business, was applied prior to all notified comments on the minutes having been debated.

At the conclusion of this item Council adjourned from 16.20 to 16.52

99 White Paper Motion (in the name of Councillor Stephenson) - Children's Safeguarding

Prior to the moving of the Motion the City Solicitor provided legal advice and guidance to Members in terms of their contributions to this debate.

It was moved by Councillor Stephenson, seconded by Councillor Andrew Carter that this Council formally recognises the publication of the Leeds Safeguarding Children's Partnership Child Safeguarding Practice Review - "Ruby" (www.leedsscp.org.uk/ruby).

Council believes there should be no circumstances in which convicted child sex offenders are given custody of a child and calls on the Executive Member for Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships to bring an urgent report to Executive Board setting out what actions the Council can take to help ensure no child in Leeds is placed into the care of a convicted child sex offender again.

An amendment was moved by Councillor Dobson, seconded by Councillor Field

Insert after the last paragraph:

"Council notes the findings of the 2014 independent enquiry into child sex exploitation in Rotherham and believes openness and transparency is critical for both independent and democratic scrutiny of children's safeguarding. Council has valued the role of the Independent Chair of the Leeds Safeguarding Children's Partnership and commits to continuing the current model of independent oversight."

The motion will read:

"This Council formally recognises the publication of the Leeds Safeguarding Children's Partnership Child Safeguarding Practice Review - "Ruby" (www.leedsscp.org.uk/ruby).

Council believes there should be no circumstances in which convicted child sex offenders are given custody of a child and calls on the Executive Member for Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships to bring an urgent report to Executive Board setting out what actions the Council can take to help ensure no child in Leeds is placed into the care of a convicted child sex offender again.

Council notes the findings of the 2014 independent enquiry into child sex exploitation in Rotherham and believes openness and transparency is critical for both independent and democratic scrutiny of children's safeguarding. Council has valued the role of the Independent Chair of the Leeds Safeguarding Children's Partnership and commits to continuing the current model of independent oversight."

The amendment in the name of Councillor Dobson was declared carried and upon being put to the vote it was

RESOLVED – That this Council formally recognises the publication of the Leeds Safeguarding Children's Partnership Child Safeguarding Practice Review - "Ruby" (www.leedsscp.org.uk/ruby).

Council believes there should be no circumstances in which convicted child sex offenders are given custody of a child and calls on the Executive Member for Adult and Children's Social Care and Health Partnerships to bring an urgent report to Executive Board setting out what actions the Council can take to help ensure no child in Leeds is placed into the care of a convicted child sex offender again.

Council notes the findings of the 2014 independent enquiry into child sex exploitation in Rotherham and believes openness and transparency is critical for both independent and democratic scrutiny of children's safeguarding. Council has valued the role of the Independent Chair of the Leeds Safeguarding Children's Partnership and commits to continuing the current model of independent oversight.

100 *White Paper Motion (in the name of Councillor Golton) - 100% Council Tax Premium applied to second homes

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 12.3(b)(c) Councillor Golton sought leave of Council to introduce the following motion in his name;

This Council notes that a 100% Council Tax Premium applied to second homes in the Leeds City Council area would currently raise £3 million annually. Council calls upon the ruling administration to make the necessary arrangements to make this change happen at the soonest possible date to better safeguard Leeds residents from future cuts to public services.

Leave of Council was granted and the motion was moved by Councillor Golton, seconded by Councillor Campbell.

An amendment was moved by Councillor B Anderson, seconded by Councillor Andrew Carter

Delete all after "This Council" and replace with:

"notes that the government's Levelling Up and Regeneration Bill includes proposals that would allow councils to introduce a Council Tax premium of up to 100% in

respect of second homes. This aims to help address the negative impact of second homes on the supply of homes available to meet local housing need.

"Council calls upon the ruling administration to bring a report to Executive Board setting out how such a policy might be implemented in Leeds, as soon as full details of the scheme are published."

A second amendment was moved by Councillor Coupar, seconded by Councillor Bithell

Remove All after "This Council" and replace with:

"...notes that a 100% Council Tax Premium applied to second homes in the Leeds City Council area would raise additional income, but this would only be a small fraction of the £181.9m annual Government funding cut from Leeds by the Liberal Democrats while in Coalition Government with the Conservatives.

Council further notes that the delayed implementation of the Government's Fair Funding Review continues to deny council services in Leeds more than £45m a year.

Council recognises that the legislation to allow Local Authorities to apply the proposed 100% Council Tax premium to second homes, the Levelling Up and Regeneration Bill, is currently progressing through Parliament and that it would not be lawful for the Council to make a determination before the Bill becomes law and receives Royal Assent.

Council therefore commits to the consideration of the proposed new legislative powers as soon as possible if and when they become law.

Council welcomes strong action taken by this Administration under existing legislation to enforce extra charges on Long Term Empty Homes. Council notes that this has generated just over £4.4m in additional income in the last 3 years.

Council further calls on Government to fully implement the Fair Funding Review to ensure Council can continue to provide vital frontline services and support the citizens of Leeds through a cost of living crisis that has been caused by the mismanagement of the economy by the Conservative Government."

The amendment in the name of Councillor B Anderson was declared lost, the amendment in the name of Councillor Coupar was carried and upon being put to the vote it was

RESOLVED –

That this Council notes that a 100% Council Tax Premium applied to second homes in the Leeds City Council area would raise additional income, but this would only be a small fraction of the £181.9m annual Government funding cut from Leeds by the Liberal Democrats while in Coalition Government with the Conservatives.

Council further notes that the delayed implementation of the Government's Fair Funding Review continues to deny council services in Leeds more than £45m a year.

Council recognises that the legislation to allow Local Authorities to apply the proposed 100% Council Tax premium to second homes, the Levelling Up and Regeneration Bill, is currently progressing through Parliament and that it would not be lawful for the Council to make a determination before the Bill becomes law and receives Royal Assent.

Council therefore commits to the consideration of the proposed new legislative powers as soon as possible if and when they become law.

Council welcomes strong action taken by this Administration under existing legislation to enforce extra charges on Long Term Empty Homes. Council notes that this has generated just over £4.4m in additional income in the last 3 years.

Council further calls on Government to fully implement the Fair Funding Review to ensure Council can continue to provide vital frontline services and support the citizens of Leeds through a cost of living crisis that has been caused by the mismanagement of the economy by the Conservative Government."

101 White Paper Motion (in the name of Councillor Lennox) - Energy Costs It was moved by Councillor Lennox, seconded by Councillor Truswell that this Council is concerned at the obscene profits recently announced by energy companies during a cost of living crisis when average annual energy costs for Leeds residents have increased by around £1000 since 2019.

Council is further concerned this comes at a time when the Government is ending the energy bill support scheme, further increasing pressures on household budgets for families in Leeds during the cost of living crisis.

This council has supported a network of Warm Spaces to mitigate the impact of this national crisis, which we know has been a vital service for people this winter. However, this should never have been necessary, because people deserve to be able to heat their own homes.

Council calls on the Government to extend the windfall tax on energy companies and use the funding to freeze energy bills now and provide further support for households in Leeds struggling in the cost of living crisis. Council further calls on the Government to move to publicly owned clean energy provision for the future.

An amendment was moved by Councillor Howley, seconded by Councillor Hart-Brooke;

Delete the final paragraph and replace with:

"Council calls on the Government to extend the windfall tax on energy companies by removing the super-deduction for oil and gas companies and use the funding to reduce energy bills further and continue support for households beyond July and until lower energy costs feed through to Leeds residents. Council further calls on the Government to remove the windfall tax on renewable electricity generators to enable further investment in the cleanest and cheapest forms of energy production." The amended White Paper will then read:

This Council is concerned at the obscene profits recently announced by energy companies during a cost of living crisis when average annual energy costs for Leeds residents have increased by around £1000 since 2019.

Council is further concerned this comes at a time when the Government is ending the energy bill support scheme, further increasing pressures on household budgets for families in Leeds during the cost of living crisis.

This council has supported a network of Warm Spaces to mitigate the impact of this national crisis, which we know has been a vital service for people this winter. However, this should never have been necessary, because people deserve to be able to heat their own homes.

Council calls on the Government to extend the windfall tax on energy companies by removing the super-deduction for oil and gas companies and use the funding to reduce energy bills further and continue support for households beyond July and until lower energy costs feed through to Leeds residents. Council further calls on the Government to remove the windfall tax on renewable electricity generators to enable further investment in the cleanest and cheapest forms of energy production.

A second amendment was moved by Councillor Lamb, seconded by Councillor Firth

Delete all after "This Council" and replace with:

"notes global economic challenges as a result of Putin's barbaric war in Ukraine which led to an inflation rate of 10 per cent in the United States, the Eurozone and the United Kingdom at the end of 2022. Council welcomes news that the UK had the fastest growing economy in the G7 last year and that the Prime Minister's plan to cut inflation is working as revised predictions show the UK economy will no longer go into recession and inflation will fall back to 3 per cent in quarter 4.

Council welcomes the substantial and continuing UK government support to help residents in Leeds and across the country deal with high energy costs and the rising cost of living. Overall, the government is providing a total of £94 billion, equivalent to £3,300 per household on average, across this financial year and next, to support households with higher costs. This includes:

- Extending the Energy Price Guarantee at £2,500 for a further three months, in addition to the £400 energy bill discount for all households.
- Extending 30 hours of childcare a week to working parents of children aged 9 months to 4 years
- Paying Universal Credit childcare costs up front rather than in arrears
- Introducing reforms to the childcare sector including changes to 2-year-old staff: child ratios from 1:4 to 1:5
- Establishing a new Universal Support programme for disabled people and the long-term sick
- Abolishing the Work Capability Assessment and increasing the Administrative Earning Threshold to 18 hours
- Freezing fuel duty for a thirteenth year, saving the average driver around £200

Council notes the government responded to the rise in energy costs by also introducing, and then extending, the Energy Profits Levy (EPL) on energy companies - taking the headline tax rate for the sector to 75 per cent - to help fund support for people in the current economic climate. Council welcomes commitments in the EPL that encourage oil and gas producers to invest in UK energy supply, further reducing our reliance on Russian gas. Council further welcomes the government's commitment to new nuclear power.

Council notes that this administration has control over the fees and charges payable by residents in Leeds for council services, and regrets that the administration has chosen to increase many of these despite the economic challenges and the impact on vulnerable residents. Council therefore calls on the administration to undertake a review of all fees and charges to see if practical changes can be made to support Leeds residents."

A third amendment was moved by Councillor Forsaith, seconded by Councillor Cunningham

After paragraph 3 insert:

"Council deeply regrets the lack of action by the Government to roll out and support a national programme of home insulation, as well as heat and electricity microgeneration, when the urgent need to respond to the climate emergency became apparent. Such a national retrofitting programme would have supported households now and in a just transition to a fairer and more sustainable future. Council further regrets the lack of action in transitioning fully to renewable sources of electricity and heat generation, which has left households still dependent on fossil fuels and their supply from other countries."

After "... struggling in the cost of living crisis." in paragraph 4 insert: "Council also calls upon the Government to come up with long-term plans and finance to help householders, and landlords, to retrofit the properties that they own."

The amended White Paper would then read:

"This Council is concerned at the obscene profits recently announced by energy companies during a cost of living crisis when average annual energy costs for Leeds residents have increased by around £1000 since 2019.

Council is further concerned this comes at a time when the Government is ending the energy bill support scheme, further increasing pressures on household budgets for families in Leeds during the cost of living crisis.

This council has supported a network of Warm Spaces to mitigate the impact of this national crisis, which we know has been a vital service for people this winter. However, this should never have been necessary, because people deserve to be able to heat their own homes.

Council deeply regrets the lack of action by the Government to roll out and support a national programme of home insulation, as well as heat and electricity microgeneration, when the urgent need to respond to the climate emergency became apparent. Such a national retrofitting programme would have supported households now and in a just transition to a fairer and more sustainable future. Council further regrets the lack of action in transitioning fully to renewable sources of electricity and

heat generation, which has left households still dependent on fossil fuels and their supply from other countries.

Council calls on the Government to extend the windfall tax on energy companies and use the funding to freeze energy bills now and provide further support for households in Leeds struggling in the cost of living crisis. Council also calls upon the Government to come up with long-term plans and finance to help householders, and landlords, to retrofit the properties that they own. Council further calls on the Government to move to publicly owned clean energy provision for the future."

The amendments in the name of Councillor Howley and Councillor Lamb were declared lost the amendment in the name of Councillor Forsaith was carried and upon being put to the vote it was

RESOLVED – That this Council is concerned at the obscene profits recently announced by energy companies during a cost of living crisis when average annual energy costs for Leeds residents have increased by around £1000 since 2019.

Council is further concerned this comes at a time when the Government is ending the energy bill support scheme, further increasing pressures on household budgets for families in Leeds during the cost of living crisis.

This council has supported a network of Warm Spaces to mitigate the impact of this national crisis, which we know has been a vital service for people this winter. However, this should never have been necessary, because people deserve to be able to heat their own homes.

Council deeply regrets the lack of action by the Government to roll out and support a national programme of home insulation, as well as heat and electricity microgeneration, when the urgent need to respond to the climate emergency became apparent. Such a national retrofitting programme would have supported households now and in a just transition to a fairer and more sustainable future. Council further regrets the lack of action in transitioning fully to renewable sources of electricity and heat generation, which has left households still dependent on fossil fuels and their supply from other countries.

Council calls on the Government to extend the windfall tax on energy companies and use the funding to freeze energy bills now and provide further support for households in Leeds struggling in the cost of living crisis. Council also calls upon the Government to come up with long-term plans and finance to help householders, and landlords, to retrofit the properties that they own. Council further calls on the Government to move to publicly owned clean energy provision for the future."

On the requisition of Councillor Lennox and Lewis the voting on the substantive motion in the name of Councillor Forsaith was recorded as follows;

YES - 64

Akhtar, Almass, Arif, Bithell, Bowden, Bromley, Brooks, Burke, Carlill, Coupar, Dowson, Dye, Farley, Flint, France-Mir, Garthwaite,Garvani, Gibson, Grahame, Gruen, Hamilton, Harland, Hayden, Heselwood, A Hussain, Z Hussain, Illingworth, Iqbal, Jenkins, Khan, Lennox, Lewis, Maloney, Marshall-Katung, Martin, McKenna, Midgley, Mulherin, Pryor, Rafique, Renshaw, Ritchie, Scopes, Sewards, Shahzad, Sharpe, Taylor, Thomson, Truswell, Tudor, Venner, Wilson, Wray, Dixon, Blackburn, Cunningham, Forsaith, Campbell, Chapman, Downes, Golton, Howley, Hart-Brooke and Lay NO - 17

Alderson, B Anderson, C Anderson, Buckley, Andrew Carter, Cohen, Firth, Flynn, Foster, Harrington, Lamb, Richards, Robinson, D Seary, S Seary, Stephenson and Wadsworth,

ABSTAIN - 3

Hutchison, Senior and Newton

Council rose at 7.20 pm